ILCOR Conflict of Interest Policy and Procedures, Including Procedures for the 2005 Consensus Conference and Evidence Evaluation Process

Endorsed ILCOR Business Meeting
September 13, 2004

This policy will ensure that ILCOR manages real and potential conflicts of interest in an open and effective manner in order to preserve public trust in the integrity of ILCOR’s process and products. It is not always possible or prudent to avoid such situations because experts in a clinical area often have relationships that could pose a real or potential conflict of interest in that area. It is essential that these potential conflicts be disclosed and managed effectively. Disclosure is the mainstay of effective management of potential conflicts of interest. COI procedures apply to all ILCOR delegates, C2005 participants, observers, editors, worksheet experts, worksheet authors, and others working on ILCOR projects.

Each ILCOR participant should follow the procedures listed below:

1. At each meeting in which resuscitation science is discussed, each ILCOR participant must disclose all relationships that could pose a direct or indirect conflict of interest. For most meetings this can be done at the time of introductions. ILCOR will keep written records of these disclosures through the minutes of the meeting. At large meetings speakers will also provide meeting organizers with a COI disclosure form before the meeting. A list of participants and their commercial relationships (commercial entity and type of relationship) will appear in the agenda/program for the meeting.

2. Each ILCOR participant will abstain from any vote in which he/she has a relationship that could pose a direct or indirect conflict of interest. The individual abstaining must leave the room during the vote. Abstentions will be recorded in the minutes.

3. Each ILCOR participant will bring COI concerns or issues to the ILCOR cochairs for investigation and resolution. If the issue involves a cochair, the issue will be raised with the other cochair.

4. Whenever possible, an individual with a substantial relationship to a particular topic or area should not be selected to lead a group or serve as a reviewer (worksheet author) for that topic. ILCOR cochairs will review disclosures by topic moderators and leaders of
any subgroup to ensure that any commercial relationships are understood and that potential conflicts are limited and manageable. This shall not prevent an individual with a substantial relationship regarding a topic from contributing to discussions and deliberations on that topic, provided the individual has disclosed those relationships during that meeting.

5. At least annually each ILCOR participant must complete the COI disclosure form and update it if substantive changes occur. The ILCOR cochairs will review the forms. Each cochair will review the other cochair's form. Difficult issues that cannot be resolved by the cochairs will be brought to the entire group for discussion and resolution.

Special Conflict of Interest Procedures for 2005 International Consensus Conference on Cardiopulmonary Resuscitation and Emergency Cardiovascular Care Science with Treatment Recommendations (C2005)

1. The formal conference invitation packet for such conferences will include the following COI-related materials:
   a. AHA COI Annual Disclosure Form
   b. AHA ECC COI Policy and Procedures
   c. ILCOR COI Policy and Procedures
   d. ILCOR COI Annual Disclosure Form

2. When returning conference registration forms, worksheet authors, participants, speakers, moderators, and attendees will also submit to the AHA both the ILCOR COI Disclosure Form and the AHA ECC COI Disclosure Form. AHA staff will collate the forms and pursue any missing forms well before the conference. Task Force chairs (BLS, ACLS, and Pediatric Resuscitation) will review forms submitted by their speakers and Task Force members for potential conflicts. Questions or problems will be brought to the ILCOR COI cochairs for resolution (David Zideman of the European Resuscitation Council and John Billi of the AHA). The AHA and ILCOR will keep written records of all disclosure forms and any actions taken. Failure to provide the disclosure form before the conference will result in the participant not being permitted to register for the conference and being removed from the program.

3. In those instances in which a worksheet author has substantive, relevant conflicts of interest, the Task Force chairs will name another
reviewer to review the worksheet, including the draft scientific conclusion. In addition, a Task Force chair or designee without a conflict of interest will write the final summary statement, with attribution.

4. When worksheets are posted on the Internet before the conference, the author’s conflict of interest will be listed even if the author’s name is not. The website will have a hyperlink from each worksheet to this policy. Those who wish to comment on the worksheets must complete the same COI form so that the worksheet authors will have that information as context for the comment.

5. For the conference the AHA will print a COI disclosure booklet that contains participants’ names, institutions, assigned participant numbers, and the basic details of any relationship that might pose a conflict (name of company and nature of relationship). This booklet will be distributed at the conference, either as a separate booklet, part of the syllabus, or both. The disclosures will also be included on the conference website.

6. During presentations moderators will introduce themselves, state their participant numbers, and disclose potential conflicts of interest. Each presenter will use the standard slide listing his/her potential conflicts of interest at the beginning of the presentation. This procedure will be enforced by the moderators. Presenters will not orally state the relationships listed on the slide but must state their participant numbers so that the audience can refer to the disclosure list. If the presentation does not contain such a slide, the moderator will ask the presenter to state his/her disclosures at the beginning of the presentation (not optimal but necessary).

7. During discussions each moderator will ask the floor speakers to identify themselves, state their participant numbers and institutions/companies, and declare any potential conflicts. Each floor speaker must make this verbal disclosure once during each worksheet topic session.

8. If COI problems arise during the conference, moderators will handle them if possible. If necessary, moderators will refer any problems to the 2 ILCOR COI cochairs for resolution. Either may call together the ad hoc COI Committee should it be needed. The ad hoc COI Committee will be composed of representatives from different councils, areas (Pediatric, Adult, Basic, etc), and outside experts in COI. If the session moderator believes the session should not continue until the COI issue is resolved, then the moderator should
move to the next presentation to allow the ILCOR COI cochairs to resolve the issue rapidly. After resolution the topic discussion can resume.

9. A poster at the conference will display the ILCOR and AHA COI policies, including a copy of the booklet listing the disclosures of each conference participant by participant number. This will inform participants about the ILCOR and AHA COI process and allow the opportunity for questions and feedback. The poster will also include the multiple steps taken to manage potential conflicts, including policies, COI review steps, use of 2 independent worksheet reviewers, the disclosure process before and during the conference, and the ad hoc COI Committee.
Notes

1. ILCOR should be especially sensitive to potential COI issues among persons selected for a leadership role with oversight or responsibility for science review of a particular area or topic. These situations must be reviewed on a case-by-case basis. ILCOR may decide that the risk to the integrity of the process from the individual’s relationship is not significant and that the individual still represents the best choice for ILCOR, taking into account the risks and benefits. If a person already playing a leadership role develops or is discovered to have a conflict that poses a significant risk to the integrity or credibility of the ILCOR process, another qualified individual without such a potential conflict should replace the first person. Such a substitution shall not imply any impropriety on the part of anyone but rather indicate a preventive step taken to avoid any perceived or real conflict from endangering the integrity of the process. A position of leadership can include the chair or vice chair of any committee, subcommittee, task force, working group, ad hoc group assigned to work on an issue, evidence panel, or evidence collection process. The fact that such perceived conflicts are usually without any improper intent does not protect the individual, ILCOR, or its work from the potential consequences of inadequate management of such a situation.

2. In addition to financial relationships, other bases of potential conflicts of interest must be considered, such as in-kind support, intellectual collaboration or intellectual investment in one’s own ideas, or a long-term research agenda in which an investigator has invested substantial time. Although these situations will be considered on an ad hoc basis, financial relationships are more likely to adversely affect the credibility of ILCOR and the integrity of its process and products.

Send questions to John Billi at jbilli@umich.edu, David Zideman at dzideman@hhnt.org, or Bill Montgomery at wmontgomery@straub.net.